Teachers and Teaching for the New Millennium: The Role of HBCUs

Jacqueline Jordan Irvine
Visiting Scholar in Urban Education
Howard University

Leslie T. Fenwick
Dean, School of Education
Howard University

U. S. Department of Education
June 9, 2009

The views expressed in this document do not necessarily reflect the official position of the United States Department of Education or the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards. This document may not be copied, reproduced, or disseminated without the express written permission of the authors.
Purpose and Organization

This paper presents a framework for a discussion of the role of Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs) that focuses on teachers and teaching for the new millennium. HBCUs have the potential to make a significant difference in solving one of the most intractable problems in K-12 education: how to recruit, retain, and develop teachers for high-need schools. There are four major sections of the paper:

1. The overview posits that HBCUs are uniquely qualified to address the challenge of high-need schools given their collective histories, institutional missions, and significant matriculation rates of African American students. Additionally, HBCUs serve an important function in diversifying the teaching workforce.

2. The second section discusses the staffing of high-need schools and presents empirical evidence supporting the following major point: With appropriate resources, HBCUs have the potential to produce significant numbers of African American teachers who are more likely than their White counterparts to work in high-need schools, particularly urban, low-income schools that enroll students of color. Of equal significance is the finding that these African American teachers are more likely than White teachers to stay in these schools.

3. The third section discusses the research that examines how African American teachers contribute to the academic success of their African American students. The findings note that African American teachers choose to work in hard-to-staff schools that enroll African American students, and these African American teachers’ cultural knowledge of their students including their students’ families and communities can translate into positive school experiences.

4. The final segment of the paper contains policy recommendations and concluding remarks.
Overview

The majority of HBCUS were established in the mid to late 1800s as precollegiate schools for newly freed slaves and normal schools for training teachers. These institutions continue to provide exceptional higher educational opportunities for African Americans in many disciplines, and their success is well documented. According to Baskerville, Berger, and Smith (2008), although HBCUs represent only 4% of all U.S. colleges and universities, they enroll approximately 16% of all African Americans in 4-year institutions, and they graduate nearly 30% of African Americans earning bachelor’s degrees, particularly in critical areas like the sciences, mathematics, and engineering. Additionally, according to a 2006 National Science Foundation report, from 1995-1999 almost a third of African American Ph.D. recipients reported receiving an undergraduate degree from an HBCU (Thurgood, Golladay, & Hill, 2006), and the top eight institutions that produced African American science and engineering doctorates in 1997-2006 were HBCUs (Burrelli & Rapoport, 2008). These data on the accomplishments of HBCUs are even more impressive given that their students are primarily low-income—with 98% qualifying for federal need-based aid (Gasman, 2008). Additionally, HBCUs operate with fewer resources due to tuition that is usually 50% lower than at White colleges and universities (Gasman, 2009) and endowments that are 91% less than all other institutions (Merisotis & McCarthy, 2005). These financial challenges, according to Merisotis and McCarthy (2005), result in HBCUs’ spending only 57% of what other schools spend on instruction, 63% of what mainstream institutions spend on student services, and 49% of what other schools spend on academic support functions.
Consistent with their historic mission, colleges of education continue to have a dominant presence on the campuses of HBCUs. Colleges of education at HBCUs have responded to the challenges of revising their curricula and programs for the new millennium with initiatives that include advanced technology, innovative recruitment strategies (e.g., Troops-to-Teachers Program, Call Me Mister), alternative routes to teaching (e.g., Transition to Teaching\(^1\)), and national certification for experienced teachers of color (e.g., National Board for Professional Teaching Standard’s Targeted High Need-Initiative).

The impact of colleges of education at HBCUs is indisputable. They graduate 50% of African American teachers with bachelor's degrees (National Association for Equal Opportunity in Higher Education, 2004), and the United Negro College Fund reported that in 1998 more than half of all African American prospective teachers in Missouri, Maryland, Louisiana, Virginia, South Carolina, North Carolina, Delaware, Alabama, and the District of Columbia were trained at HBCUs (Freeman, 2001). In many urban and rural settings that have HBCUs, these institutions furnish high percentages of teachers to the local school district. Consequently, HBCUs have had a major role in diversifying America’s mostly White teaching force.

Though progress has been made, the lack of teacher diversity continues to be an undeniable problem in the field. Currently, 43% of students in our nation’s schools come from ethnically diverse backgrounds, and in our largest school districts, at least half of the students are African American and Latino (Orfield & Lee, 2007). However, in the 2003-04 academic year, African American teachers represented only 7.6% of the teaching force. The absence of a critical

\(^1\) The Ready to Teach Program at Howard University is the second and current iteration of Transition to Teaching, which is funded by the U. S. Department of Education. The Ready to Teach Program at Howard University may emerge as a model for the recruitment, preparation, and placement of African American male teachers in high-need schools. The program is a collaborative effort led by the Howard University School of Education in partnership with five urban school districts: Chicago, Illinois; Clayton County, Georgia; Houston, Texas; Prince Georges County, Maryland; and Washington, DC. The first cohort of participants completed an accelerated MAT program in the 2009 spring semester.
mass of teachers of color is an important matter. All students benefit from exposure to effective teachers of color who serve as role models and authority figures in the schools. As the Carnegie Forum on Education and the Economy asserted decades ago, “We cannot tolerate a future in which both white and minority children are confronted with almost exclusively white authority figures in their schools” (1986, p. 32).

There is clear evidence that a larger pool of effective teachers of color makes a difference in the lives of students of color as well as White students (King, 1993; Foster, 1997). Teachers of color do more than just teach content. They dispel myths of racial inferiority and incompetence and serve as surrogate parents, guides, and mentors to their students (Dilworth, 1992; Dilworth & Brown, 2007). Moreover, diversity among teachers increases teachers’ and students’ knowledge and understanding of different cultural groups, thereby enhancing the abilities of all involved to interact with each other. It is clear that diversifying the nation’s teaching force is essential to the racial and ethnic integration of American society, a goal that the majority of Americans support.

Staffing High-Need Schools

In this age of increased educational accountability, providing high-quality teachers for all students is critical because the single most important school factor affecting student achievement is teacher quality (Darling-Hammond, 2000). Indeed, the difference between an effective and ineffective teacher can be a full grade level of achievement in the course of a single school year (Hanushek, 1986; Vandevoort, Amerein-Beardsley, & Berliner, 2004) and exposure to a series of ineffective teachers has obvious detrimental consequences for students (National Association of State Boards of Education, 2000).
Hence one of the nation’s major educational concerns is the search for qualified and caring teachers for low-income students of color and for immigrant students, who will soon become the majority population in public schools (Gordon, 2000). Using a quantitative measure to define Opportunity to Learn, The Schott Foundation (2009) stated in a recent report that Native American, Black, and Latino students, taken together, have just over half of the opportunity to learn as White, non-Latino students in the nation’s best-supported, best-performing schools. A low-income student, of any race or ethnicity, also has just over half of the opportunity to learn as the average White, non-Latino student. The Foundation concluded that “half a chance is substantively no chance at all” (p. 6). Hence, the availability of qualified, effective, and caring teachers for schools that enroll these types of students is especially acute. When disaggregated by the racial and economic composition of the school, the data disclose alarming trends.

Ingersoll’s (2004) analyses revealed that 33% of new teachers leave teaching within the first 3 years, and by 5 years after being hired, nearly half (46%) of all teachers have left the profession. The annual turnover rates in urban high-poverty schools are nearly 70% higher than are the turnover rates in low-poverty schools.

The severity of this attrition problem is noted by the continuing Black-White test score gap. A 2009 Educational Testing Service (ETS) report updated and expanded its 2003 quantitative analyses of the correlates of achievement and concluded that although the gap narrowed in some areas and widened in others, “overall there is little change” (Barton & Coley, 2009, p. 3). ETS reported that among eighth graders in 2007, 52% of African American students had a teacher who left before the school year ended compared to 28% of White students. Equally disturbing is the finding that 11% of African American students, as compared to 8% of White
students, attended a school where 6% or more of the teachers were absent on an average day. Research suggests that the absence rate of teachers is important to track because it is associated with low student achievement (Clotfelter, Ladd, & Vigdor, 2007; Miller, Murnane, & Willett, 2007).

Teacher attrition and absences are not the only concerns in predominantly African American high-poverty schools; students in these schools are also twice as likely as students in other schools to be taught by the most inexperienced teachers. Studies of inexperienced teachers consistently find that they have difficulty with curriculum development, classroom management, student motivation, and teaching strategies (Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005). A recent Washington Post study of 12 metropolitan DC school systems revealed that in schools where fewer than 10% of the students received free or reduced lunch, first- or second-year teachers made up only 12% of the staff (de Vise & Chandler, 2009). In high-poverty schools in these districts (75% or more subsidized meals), the percentage of novice teachers rose to 22%. Researchers have noted that experience alone does not make for an effective teacher. However, studies point out that most novice teachers improve their practice over time (Rockoff, 2004).

Unfortunately, many students of color in high-need schools are taught by a revolving door of mostly inexperienced teachers, and the financial costs associated with this turnover are tremendous. The cost of teacher turnover in this country is $2.6 billion annually (Alliance for Excellent Education, 2004).

The literature suggests that teachers of color, particularly African American teachers, could reduce the acute shortage and high turnover of teachers in urban schools that enroll mostly low-income African American students. Using data from the Status Survey administered every 5 years by the National Education Association, Villegas (2006) found that a significantly larger
percentage of teachers of color than White teachers taught in urban communities between 1981 and 2001. Specifically, at least half of all teachers of color reported teaching in urban settings, compared to only about one-fifth of all White teachers. The concentration of teachers of color in urban schools has also been reported by Choy (1993); Clewell and Villegas (2001); Clotfelter, Ladd and Vigdor (2005); Gay, Dingus, and Jackson (2003); Kirby, Berends, and Naftel (1999); and Villegas and Geist (2008).

Scafidia, Sjoquistb, and Stinebrickner (2007), using quantitative economic risk models, revealed a more complex finding about the tenure of teachers in high-poverty schools. The researchers found that African American teachers in high-poverty schools are more likely to remain in a school as the number of African American students increases. White teachers are likely to leave. Interestingly, the researchers found that the challenge of teaching in a school with a concentration of high-poverty students was not the primary reason the White teachers left. The teachers left a “particular type of poor school—one with a large proportion of minorities” (p. 145). Similar results were found in a Georgia study (Jonsson, 2003). White teachers left schools with large proportions of minorities whether the students were middle-class African American or low-income African American.

Villegas and Irvine’s (2009) analyses of the research explain these variations in the attrition rates of Black and White teachers. Their work reveals that teachers of color and White teachers differ in their motivation for entering the profession. Teachers of color report a desire to work with students of color and to improve these students’ educational outcomes and personal lives (Belcher, 2001; Kauchak & Burback, 2003; Horng, 2005; Rios & Montecinos, 1999; Su, 1997; Wilder, 1999). Irvine (2002) reported that African American teachers in her study tended to see teaching as a calling, reminiscent of the historic “lifting as we climb” philosophy. Dixson
and Dingus (2008) and others (Lynn, 2006; Su, 1997) found that African American teachers in their investigations purposefully entered teaching to give back to the community by returning to teach in their community of origin. Their reasons for entering the teaching profession could help explain the attraction of teachers of color to schools in urban high-need communities and account for the higher retention rates of teachers of color in those settings. For example, using data from North Carolina and Michigan, Murnane, Singer, Willett, Kemple, and Olsen (1991) found that teachers of color in those states stayed in teaching longer than White teachers, even after controlling for district-level fixed effects like school size and poverty level.

In summary, the evidence suggests that compared to White teachers, educators of color appear to be more committed to teaching students of color in difficult-to-staff schools and more apt to persist in those settings. Villegas and Irvine’s (2009) work suggests that an increase in the numbers of African American teachers could alleviate the severe shortage of teachers for the students and schools with the greatest needs.

The Potential of Teachers of Color to Improve the Academic Outcomes and School Experiences of Students of Color

A second major justification for increasing the diversity of the teaching force suggested by Villegas and Irvine (2009) underscores the academic benefits that students of color could derive from teachers who are knowledgeable about their cultural backgrounds. Specifically, the argument suggests that teachers of color are particularly suited to teaching students of color because they bring to their work a deep understanding of the cultural experiences of these learners.

Villegas and Irvine’s (2009) review concluded that although the literature on the influence of African American teachers on the school achievement of their African American
students is only beginning to emerge, several studies suggest some positive effects. In an impressive quantitative study, researchers Meier, Stewart, and England (1989) investigated the relationship between the presence of African American teachers and African American students’ access to equal education. Specifically, they investigated the following question: Does having African American educators impact African American students' school success? The researchers’ findings highlighted the importance of having African American teachers in desegregated schools. In school districts with large proportions of African American teachers, the researchers found the following:

- Fewer African Americans were placed in special education classes;
- Fewer African Americans were suspended or expelled;
- More African Americans were placed in gifted and talented programs; and
- More African Americans graduated from high school.

The authors emphatically concluded that "African American teachers are without a doubt the key" to students’ academic success (p. 6).

In her study of teachers’ perceptions of African American male students, Couch-Maddox (1999) found that African American teachers were more likely than their White peers to describe African American male students as “intellectually capable.” The African American teachers also reported that these male students engaged in positive school behaviors such as completing homework, attending school regularly, and serving in leadership roles (Fenwick, 2001).

Dee (2004) reanalyzed data from Tennessee’s Project STAR and concluded that racial pairing of teachers and students significantly increased the reading and math achievement scores of both African American and White students by approximately three to four percentage points. Interestingly, Dee reported that the race effects were especially strong among poor African
American children who attended segregated schools. The average African American child attends schools where 67% of students are African American and 75% are poor. This fact underscores the importance of research on race effects (Center for Educational Policy, 2006).

Clewell, Puma, and McKay (2005), using the Prospects database, raised the question: Does exposure to a same-race teacher increase the reading and mathematics achievement scores of African American and Hispanic students in elementary schools? The researchers found that Hispanic fourth- and sixth-grade students with a Hispanic teacher produced higher test score gains in math. In reading, the same effect was noted, but only in the fourth grade. The effect for African American students with African American teachers was somewhat weaker; although, fourth-grade African American students had significantly higher scores in mathematics when taught by an African American teacher.

Klopfenstein (2005) reported that the enrollment of African American students in algebra II increased significantly as the percentage of mathematics teachers who were African American increased. Other researchers have found that African American teachers, when compared to their White counterparts, are more successful in increasing student scores in vocabulary and reading comprehension (Hanushek, 1992) as well as economic literacy (Evans, 1992). Ehrenberg and Brewer (1995), using an econometric model that accounted for the non-random nature of teacher assignment to schools, found that an increase in the percentage of African American teachers resulted in scores gains on standardized tests for African American high school students.

Also of note are findings that African American teachers influenced African American students’ school attendance (Farkas, Grobe, Sheehan, & Shuan, 1990) and that these teachers had higher expectations for their African American students than their White counterparts did (Irvine, 1990). Other empirical works, such as a study by Hess and Leal (1997), suggested a
correlation between the number of teachers of color in a district and college matriculation rates among students of color.

Recommendations

The recommendations in this section address the issues of the role of HBCUs that focuses on teachers and teaching for the new millennium. If HBCUs’ colleges of education are to continue their mission of educating teachers for high-need schools, significant financial resources and other support mechanisms should be available to them.

The recommendations discussed in this section are directed to policymakers and organized by using a professional continuum of teacher development that includes recruitment, preparation, induction/retention, continuing professional development, and national certification. Although the recommendations target how policymakers can support and leverage the resources and strengths of African American higher education institutions, the paper’s authors acknowledge that the solutions for increasing the number of African American teachers is a pipeline issue. The shortage of African Americans in teaching is related to the insufficient number of African American students who graduate from high school with strong academic skills that prepare them for college and teacher education programs (Vegas, Murnane, Willett, 2001). In other words, African American students are not less attracted to teaching than White students. The problem is that African American students are not taking college preparatory classes and graduating from high school with the skills necessary to be competent teachers. The Obama Education Agenda promotes early childhood education, highly qualified teachers, college and career-ready curriculum standards, state-of-the-art assessment and accountability systems, and access to higher education. This agenda will have a positive impact on increasing the number of effective African American teachers for high-need schools.
Recruitment

Provide support and incentives to HBCUs to support innovative, research-based teacher education programs and provide monies for new teacher education initiatives.

Funding from philanthropic, federal, and state sources should target colleges of education at HBCUs. HBCUs prepare the majority of the nation’s African American teachers and have been involved in substantial reform efforts that inform national and regional policy and practice.

Invest in teacher recruitment efforts at middle schools with significant enrollments of students of color, as well as in high schools.

The data about the impact of precollegiate programming aimed at sparking high school students’ interest in the teaching profession is promising (Darling-Hammond, Dilworth, & Bullmaster, 1996). However, middle school students might benefit from early exposure, as well. Funding for such programs should support teacher career exploration modules, formation of future teachers clubs, and future teacher magnet programs at the middle grades level.

Assist HBCUs with the recruitment of both traditional and nontraditional students for teacher education.

Recruitment sites for African American teachers include paraprofessionals in K-12 schools, community colleges, civil rights and community organizations, churches, childcare, and other social service organizations. Recruiting New Teachers (2002) identified successful programs at community colleges where large numbers of students of color matriculate, graduate, and transfer to teacher education programs at 4-year institutions. Other promising recruitment strategies include district-level “grow your own” programs with tuition scholarships.
Assist HBCUs with the recruitment of African American males.

African American male teachers are underrepresented in K-12 schools. For example, in the 2001-02 academic year, the number of African American females who earned a bachelor’s degree from a HBCU was 1355, African American males, 550 (National Center for Educational Statistics, 2004). These small numbers explain why fewer than 2% of teachers are African American males (Lewis, 2006). Particular attention should be paid to not only recruiting and enrolling males at HBCUs but graduating them as well.

Create more federal scholarships, fellowships, and loan forgiveness programs to encourage African American students to pursue teaching and/or graduate study in education.

Many African American students are the first to attend college in their families. Financial assistance and other support services are rarely available to assist these students. The U.S. Department of Education should continue to use legislation like the Higher Education Act and state Teacher Quality Enhancement Grants to expand scholarships, fellowships and loan forgiveness programs. Additional incentives for teaching in high-need schools should be implemented for African American teachers who work in critical areas like mathematics, science, ESOL, and special education.

Preparation

Support national accreditation and ongoing assessment of teacher education programs at HBCUs.

Policymakers should support ongoing internal and external examinations of teacher education programs at HBCUs to determine if the programs build on the institution’s mission and strengths and are based in the best research on teacher preparation and development, including the areas of content knowledge, pedagogy, and pedagogical content knowledge.
(Shulman, 1987). Currently, there are 84 teacher education programs at HBCUs, and 62 (74%) are accredited by the National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education (NCATE; B. C. Williams, personal communication, May 12, 2009). The Teacher Education Accreditation Council (TEAC) currently has one school of education at an HBCU as a candidate for accreditation (TEAC, 2009).

These numbers will increase only when HBCUs are granted the resources necessary to establish and maintain a continuous culture of assessment without struggling to meet accreditation standards. Targeted resources could assist with creating an assessment infrastructure and hiring personnel dedicated to this strategic function. Further, HBCUs need additional funding for certification examination preparation and student support services like childcare, flexible scheduling, tutoring, counseling, and financial assistance (Clewell & Villegas, 2001).

Support programs that are based in sound research and positive outcomes for learners that plan, implement, and evaluate alternative routes to teaching.

More context-specific models of alternative programs for teacher education are needed. The current debate over traditional versus alternative programs is mostly directed at structural issues such as the program’s duration, the degree offered, and the sponsoring institution. The extant research that looks at these structural elements is inconclusive and often contradictory. More attention has to be placed on investigating substantive and contextual issues like the quality of the admissions process, curriculum, the fieldwork, and the social and institutional context (Zeichner & Conklin, 2008). HBCUs are excellent sites for investigating this multilayered approach in teacher education.
Develop a statewide strategy for eliminating racial disparities in pass rates on teacher licensure exams and advocate for the development of new assessment measures that do not maintain or exacerbate existing racial disparities.

One major barrier to producing more African American teachers is the requirement to demonstrate proficiency in basic skills by passing a single measure of teacher competence: a standardized test. With teacher shortages in every state and dwindling enrollments in teacher preparation programs, the nation can ill afford to use standardized tests to screen out individuals who have expressed an interest in becoming a teacher and possess other requisite abilities.

Induction/Retention

Support teacher education programs built on university-school district collaborations that focus on the induction and retention of novice teachers.

The data discussed in this paper pinpoint the severity of the attrition problem in schools that serve some African American students. Induction and mentoring programs for beginning teachers show promise in rectifying this situation. Evidence from the National Center for Education Statistics’ Schools and Staffing Survey suggests that participation in comprehensive induction programs can cut attrition in half (American Association of State Colleges and Universities, 2006). Strong (2006) conducted studies at the New Teacher Center and found a relationship between induction support and student achievement. These studies suggest that beginning teachers who receive comprehensive induction support for 2 years are more likely to have classes that achieve reading gains than those who do not receive this support. Additionally data from the New Teacher Center study found that 88% of teachers were still in education 6 years after participating in a mentoring program.
Continuing Professional Development

HBCUs and school districts should provide collaborative school-based professional development programs for novice and experienced teachers that focus on rigorous assessments of student outcomes that improve student learning and teacher performance.

Effective professional development programs are linked to enhanced teacher learning and student achievement. They enhance teachers’ content knowledge, are aligned with standards, are school-based, are driven by student learning data, are based on best evaluation practices, and promote collegiality and collaboration (Guskey, 2006). The American Educational Research Association’s (2005) review of the literature states that in order to enhance student achievement, professional development should focus on teachers’ improvement of knowledge of the subject matter they teach and on students’ learning.

National Certification

Support collaborative university and school-based programs that produce African American Board-certified teachers.

The National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS) and its assessments complement initial teacher preparation, licensing, accreditation, and quality professional development. NBPTS is the greatest distinction for accomplished teachers in the U.S., with the standards and assessments serving as a model for nations worldwide. A congressionally mandated 3-year evaluation found that NBPTS exemplifies the characteristics of effective professional development and promotes student achievement and learning (Hakel, Koenig, & Elliott, 2008). Importantly, the data revealed that Board-certified teachers benefited African American and Hispanic students more than other students (Cavalluzzo, 2004). There are approximately 74,000 Board-certified teachers, of which 7,667 are African American and other
teachers of color. More are needed to provide leadership in high-need schools and to contribute an important cultural lens and understanding to effective practice.

Concluding Remarks

Although this paper documents the instructional behaviors and attributes of effective African American teachers, it does not ignore the fact that some White teachers are excellent instructors for students of color and that some teachers of color are ineffective with culturally diverse students (Ladson-Billings, 1994). Nevertheless, the literature reveals that the recruitment, retention, and professional development of African American teachers have positive benefits for African American students and the high-need schools that many of them attend.

Unfortunately, African American teachers often work in various contexts and conditions that mitigate and often neutralize their impact. These conditions make their work more difficult, constrain their efforts to teach, and impact their expectations and their students’ achievement. Their presence alone cannot compensate or obliterate the effects of decades of neglect and ineffective policies and practices in schools where students of color attend. Additionally, recent data suggest that African American teacher turnover is increasing (Ingersoll, 2009). During the 2005-06 academic year, African American teacher turnover was 20.7% compared to 19.4% for other teachers of color and 16.4% for White teachers. These new data suggest that the teaching profession may not be able to continue to attract effective African American teachers in high-need schools without significant resources aimed at recruiting and retaining them. This challenge should be a national educational priority. HBCUs have both a historical record of and institutional commitment to producing significant numbers of African American teachers, and with increased financial support, can produce more in the future.
References


